

Country Coordinating Mechanism (BCCM)

Ministry of Health and Family Welfare BCCM Secretariat

Subject: Minutes of the 18th Oversight Committee meeting.

Date (dd.mm.yy)	05.12.2017				
Venue of the meeting	Mini Conference Room, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Bangladesh Secretariat				
Meeting started	11:00am				
Meeting adjourned	01.00pm				
Meeting Chaired By	Ms. Roxana Quader, Additional Secretary (PH&WH), HSD, MOHFW and Chair, Oversight Committee of BCCM				
Meeting Steered by	Mr. Manaj Kumar Biswas, Coordinator, BCCM Secretariat				
Total number of participants	14				
Meeting attendance	 Members of Oversight Committee: 07 Principal Recipients (PRs): 04 BCCM Secretariat Staff: 02 Others: Global Fund CCM Expert 01 (Techl) 				
Attendance list	Yes				
Others supporting document	Yes				

Meeting Agenda:

Agenda No.	Title of Agenda			
	Part One			
01	Approval of 17 th OC Meeting Minutes			
02 Draft OIG Audit Report				
	Part Two			
03	Draft OIG Investigation Report (NTP)			
04	Draft Code of Conduct for BCCM Member and alternate members			

The meeting started at 11:00am and was chaired by **Roxana Quader**, Additional Secretary (PH&WH), HSD, MOHFW and Chair, BCCM Oversight Committee. At the commencement, Hon'ble Chair on behalf of BCCM Oversight Committee welcomed all the participants. The Chair requested BCCM Coordinator to steer the meeting in accordance with set agenda.

Accordingly, BCCM Coordinator started presenting the agenda one by one. The participants took part in the discussion and lead to the decisions.



DISCUSSION(S) AND DECISION(S):

Agenda Item #1: Approval of the minutes of 17th Oversight Committee Meeting

Conflict of Interest: N/A

Discussions by the Constituencies:

BCCM Secretariat: Mr. Manaj Kumar Biswas, BCCM Coordinator informed the meeting that the participation of OC members is not enough to endorse the 17th OC meeting minutes. Thus, we can endorse the meeting notes in the next meeting.

The Chairperson: The Chair requested the participants to express their opinion.

<u>OC member(s):</u> Prof. Dr. Mahmudur Rahman, Former Director, IEDCR and Vice Chair, BCCM Oversight Committee opined that we can forward these agenda to next meeting and continue with other agenda which are now in need of greater attention.

Decision: The 18th OC meeting decided to include the agenda in the next meeting.

Agenda Item # 2: Draft OIG Audit Report

Conflict of Interest: N/A

Discussions by the Constituencies:

BCCM Secretariat: BCCM Coordinator informed the meeting that OIG send the Draft Audit Report on 24 November 2017 which shared with CCM and OC members immediately by the BCCM Secretariat for review and comments. He also presented the highlights of draft OIG Audit report and informed that the report is included in the folder.

<u>The Chairperson:</u> The Chair of the meeting invited the participants to comment on the report. The Chair also requested to go through the detail report.

Principal Recipient(s): PRs' representatives informed the meeting that OIG shared initial draft with respective PRs and they have sent their comments prior to the development of shared version. And they have agreed with these findings. However, Prof. Dr. Sanya Tahmina, Linde Director, NMEP informed the meeting that the report mentioned "The country is working towards malaria elimination with 51 out of the 64 districts considered to be low malaria endemic areas. These demonstrate significant progress made by the funded programs" which not the fact. She informed the meeting that The Global Fund grants are being used only in the 13 endemic districts of the country. Activities for malaria control program, though in small scale, in these 51 districts are being carried out by GoB financing. Thus, it requires some modification.

<u>OC member(s):</u> OC members conducted in depth discussion with PRs. Mr. Motaher Hossen, Deputy Secretary (WH), MOHFW and member BCCM Oversight Committee argued that BCCM and OC members' contribution to the grant implementation of GF funds could be included in the report as these has created significant impact.

Prof. Dr. Mahmudur Rahman, Former Director, IEDCR and Vice Chair, BCCM Oversight Committee suggested that Dr. Sharful Islam Khan, Scientist and Head, Program for HIV and AIDS, IDD, icddr,b would coordinate with other HIV PRs and ensure communication if they have anything to incorporate. These comments will then be incorporated in the letter and in the meeting minutes.

<u>Decision(s)</u>: The 18th meeting of BCCM Oversight Committee decided to request incorporation of following comments in the letter to be signed with the Hon'ble minister to be sent to the OIG office:

• The OIG audit team can give some opinions and comments about the functioning and activeness of Bangladesh CCM, BCCM Oversight Committee & its functioning to



remove bottlenecks of grants implementation as well as BCCM Secretariat functioning in good practices section in the draft report.

The following points could be included in final report regarding three diseases program:

- Fifty-one (51) districts were mentioned as low endemic districts as the evidence of significant progress made by the funded programs. Those districts are considered as non-endemic at this stage. The utilization of GF grant is limited to 13 endemic districts until now. So, suggestion is to mention this huge achievement in malaria morbidity and mortality reduction in 13 endemic districts. Another suggestion is to verify again the incidence rate of Malaria in Bangladesh mentioned in page number 10 of this draft report.
- National Tuberculosis Control Program (NTP) has proceeded to procure all first line TB drugs to increase government commitment and domestic financing and NTP also initiated process to place TB and Leprosy Control Assistant under government funding who were recruited under Global Fund earlier.
- Any formal assessment was not conducted to assess the capacity of GoB facility to deliver the care support treatment program here in Bangladesh. But last two years (2015-2017) ASP gained experience through implementation of the care support program in those facilities and have some observations. Similarly, another program titled PMTCT has been implementing since long in those settings. During this transition, several discussions were organized with different stakeholder including PLHIV network, Hospital Directors, UN bodies, TWG meeting, BCCM special meeting, to minimize the challenges gained through the past intervention.
- Regarding staffing for HIV treatment care and support, all six (6) hospitals deployed medical officers and senior staff nurse to carry over the ART center services. All those staff received ART training from national program to deliver the services. Hospital authority allocated sufficient spaces for the ART center also renovated by their own cost. ASP, DGHS along with PLHIV network (Chair and general secretary) visiting every month of the ART center to monitor the activities. Meanwhile as of November, 2017 report 1213 PLHIV received services out of 2123. Hope rest number will receive drug as per their drug schedule.

Agenda Item #3: Draft OIG Investigation Report (NTP)

Conflict of Interest: N/A

Discussions by the Constituencies:

BCCM Secretariat: BCCM Coordinator informed the meeting that OIG send the Draft Investigation Report on 29 November 2017 which shared with CCM and OC members immediately by the BCCM Secretariat for review and comments. He also presented the highlights of draft OIG Investigation Report and informed that the report is included in the folder.

The Chair person: The Chair of the meeting invited the participants to discuss and make comments for feedback on the report. The Chair also requested to go through the detail report.

Principal Recipient(s): Dr. Rouseli Hoque, Director, MBDC informed the meeting that some precautionary measures have already been taken from their office e.g. detachment of alleged staff from daily operation, change of financial team etc. She also informed the meeting that some of the government officials has already been transferred and legal action could not be done until the investigation is completed.



<u>OC member(s):</u> Mr. Motaher Hossen, Deputy Secretary (WH), MOHFW and member BCCM Oversight Committee informed the meeting that team has been reformed to functionalize and investigate the issue which is currently working to find the causes and involved personnel. Once the report is prepared, authority will be able to take some official corrective measure, as applicable.

Prof. Dr. Mahmudur Rahman, Former Director, IEDCR and Vice Chair, BCCM Oversight Committee advised that Oversight Committee should bring the issue to BCCM to take it seriously. The Oversight Committee should suggest Line Director to take immediate departmental action against person who are involved in this non-compliance. He mentioned that MOHFW already formed an investigation team, they would investigate and if person is blamed for these irregularities who involved as reported by OIG then government should take action permanently. He also said that Global Fund LFA verification should be more cautious, so that PRs cannot do anything like this case.

Members of Oversight Committee reviewed the report in depth and summarized some status update and recommendation to incorporate in the letter to be signed by Hon'ble Minister, MOHFW.

<u>Decision(s)</u>: The 18th meeting of BCCM Oversight Committee decided to request incorporation of following comments in the letter to be signed with the Hon'ble minister to be sent to the OIG office:

- An investigation team headed by Additional Secretary (Admin), Health Services Division, MOHFW and initiated further investigation on the basis of 3rd party audit report and draft OIG investigation report for departmental actions against the persons who were involved.
- NTP has removed the involved staff form training and other finance related noncompliance identified by the OIG Investigation and essential trainings are being continued by a payment mechanism through BRAC as suggested by the Global Fund.
- To reform the structure of the financial management staff and reporting system at NTP, NTP has initiated the recruitment process for proposed positions (Financial Management Specialist-1, Finance Officer-1 and Finance Assistant -1).
- LFA should more careful during their regular verification in the PR's program implementations to identify the voluntary and non-voluntary noncompliance at initial stage to mitigate the risk before happening the big occurrence.
- Deputy Director (NTP) has been directed to explain in relation to his involvement in the procurement related noncompliance as the signatory of the Bank Account for Training. Accordingly, Deputy Director has submitted his explanation to the Line Director NTP.

Agenda Item # 4: Draft Code of Conduct for BCCM Member and alternate members

Conflict of Interest: N/A

Discussions by the Constituencies:

BCCM Secretariat: BCCM Coordinator informed the meeting that CCM Hub of The Global Fund has shared, through email, updated Code of Conduct for CCM members to provide input from CCM members. It was included in the 92nd BCCM meeting held on 21 November 2017 and shared with all CCM and OC members for review and comment through email. It need to be reviewed and send feedback, if any, to The Global Fund as it would be the guiding document for the CCM member after the endorsement of The Global Fund's next board meeting.

<u>OC member(s):</u> Prof. Dr. Mahmudur Rahman, Former Director, IEDCR and Vice Chair, BCCM Oversight Committee opined that it is not new for the CCM members. He also informed the meeting that he did not find any critical or conflicting issue in this new document.



<u>Other(s):</u> Mr. Abu Sayeed, Former Lead Consultant, GMS and The Global Fund expert informed the meeting that he also did not find any critical changes in the document. But he opined that CCM members should be oriented on this as they are busy with their regular job and have no spare time to spend time one it.

<u>Decision(s)</u>: The 18th meeting of BCCM Oversight Committee decided to inform CCM Hub of The Global Fund in writings e.g. though email about the Zero feedback on this document.

Having no other issues to discuss, the Chairperson thanked all the participants for their attendance and active participation and wrapped up the meeting.

Roxana Quader

Additional Secretary (PH&WH)
Health Services Division,
Ministry of Health and Family Welfare,
and

Chair, Oversight Committee of BCCM

Bangladesh Country Coordinating Mechanism 18th Oversight Committee Meeting

Attendance sheet

Vanue: Mini Conference Room, MOH&FW, Bangladesh Secretariat

Date: 05 December 2017

	I Section 1		COLOR DESIGNATION OF THE PROPERTY OF THE PROPE				Date: 05 December 2017
Sl. No.	Salutation	Name	Institution	Title (Designation)	Telephone	Email	Singnature
				Chair & Vice Chair of Ov	ersight Committee	LOS PORTAGONES DE PROPERTO DE LA COMPETA	A STATE OF STREET STREET
01	Ms.	Roxana Quader	MOH&FW	Add. Secratry, PH&WHO	+8801710894497	roxanaquader@gmail.com	R
02	Mr.	Prodip Ranjan Chakrabortay	МОНА	Additional Secretary	+8801715055491	prc5287/@yahoo.com	
03	Prof.	Dr. Mahmudur Rahman, PhD	MOH&FW	Former Director, IEDCR	+8801711595139	mrahman57@hotmail.com	Maland
				Program Managem	ent Specialist	(2.15)E. L. F. C.	
04	Mr.	Md. Motaher Hossen	MOH&FW	Dep. Secretary (WH)	+88017779212099	motaher6679@gmail.com	30000000
05	Ms.	Gabrielle Mathieu	High Comm of Canada	First Secretary	+8801713 013199	Gabrielle Mathieu@international.gc.ca	,
06	Mr.	Md. Kamrul Islam Kanedy	Renata Ltd.	Head of Institutional Business & Healthcare Products	+8801817049448	kenedy@renata-ltd.com	
				Disease Specialist	t- Malaria		
07	Prof.	Dr. M A Faiz	Ex. DGHS	Malaria Expert	+8801713008858	drmafaiz@gmail.com	
08	Prof.	Dr. Meerjady Sabrina Flora	MOH&FW	Director, IEDCR	+8801713083893	meerflora@yahoo.com	
				Disease Special	list- TB		
09	Prof.	Dr. Asif Mujtaba Mahmud	Consultant, Asgar Ali Hospital	TB Expert	+8801819238333	asifmahmud60@gmail.com	V
10	Dr.	Charles Lerman	USAID	TB adviser	+8801755637029	clerman@usaid.gov	·
			Land Market	Disease Speciali	ist- HIV		
11	Dr.	Saima Khan	UNAIDS	Advisor	+8801730057832	liyanagej@searo.who.int	
12	Dr.	Tasnim Azim	Indepenent	HIV Specialist	+8801713090403	azim.tasnim@gmail.com	

Sl. No.	Salutation	Name	Institution	Title (Designation)	Telephone	Email	Singnature	
	Specialist-Finance							
13	Dr.	A.E.Md. Mohiuddin Osmani	MOH&FW	Jt Chief, Planning	+8801817117703	helalu06@yahoo.com		
14	Mr.	Milon Kanti Datta	ВНВСОР	Predium Member	+8801727346990	milon_kanti_datta@gmail.com	to a	
				A				
15	Mr.	Zahedul Islam	MSH/SAIPS	Country Project Director	01713238655	zaislam@msh.org		
16	Dr.	Mr. S. M. Abu Zahid	MSH/SAIPS	Team Leader	01711886886	azahid@msh.org		
				KAP-PLHI	V			
17	Mr.	Ahsanul Alam Kishore	PLHIV Network	PLHIV	+8801833104791	ahsanul.kishore@gmail.com	Mark	
18	Ms.	Aleya Akter Lily	FSW Network	KAP - HIV	+8801816657732	showshg@gmail.com		
				CCM and GF Proc	ess Expert			
19	Mr.	Abu Sayeed	- GMS	CCM and GF Process Expert/GMS	+8801711521145	asaveed@techai.com	026	
				CCM Secreta	riat			
20	Mr.	Manaj Kumar Biswas	CCM Secretariat	CCM Coordinator	+8801718171958	bcemcoordinator@gmail.com	Molm	
21	Mr.	Mohammad Harun-Or-Rasid	CCM Secretariat	Deputy Coordinator	+8801817524001	dc.becm@gmail.com	mored	
10-5				PR Representa	atives			
22	Prof	Dr. Sanya Tahmina	NMEP, DGHS	Director CDC & LD, NMEP	+8801819454279, +8801914198680	directordcbd@gmail.com	Sama 5/12/17	
23	Dr.	M M Aktaruzzaman	NMCP, DGHS	DPM- Malaria	+8801711302584	mmaktaruzzaman93@gmail.com		
24	Dr.	Md. Ehteshamul Huq Choudhury	DGHS	ADG (Admin), DGHS and LD, TB & ASP	+8801711434300	ehchy@hotmail.com		
25	Dr.	Dr. Rouseli Haq	NTP, DGHS	Director, NTP	+8801711357553	directormbde@gmail.com	Round Hun 5-12-2017	
26	Dr.	Mojibur Rahman	NTP, DGHS	NPC, NTP	+8801912728871, +8801711467347	drmdmojib@gmail.com		
27	Dr.	Md.Anisur Rahman	NASP, DGHS	Director & KD-NASP	+8801715182052	stdaids2008@gmail.com		

. 10

Sl. No.	Salutation	Name	Institution	Title (Designation)	Telephone	Email	Singnature
28	Dr.	Md. Belal Hossain	NASP, DGHS	Deputy Director & PM, NASP	+8801711894740	drbelalhossain4963 @gmail.com	
29	Dr.	Akramul Islam	BRAC	Director, TB, Malaria and WASH	+8801711837746	akramul.mi@brac.net	A.V.Sa
30	Dr.	Moktadir Kabir	BRAC	Program Head, Malaria and WASH	+8801714091490	moktadir.k@brac.net	
31	Dr.	Milon Kanti Barua	BRAC	Program Head, TB	+8801714091375	milan.kb@brac.net	
32	Dr.	Sharful Islam Khan	icddr,b	Scientist and Head, Program for HIV and AIDS, IDD	+8801713040944	sharful@icddrb.org	
33	Dr.	AKM Masud Rana	icddr,b	Project Coordinator, Program for HIV and AIDS, IDD	+8801730727953	akmrana@icddrb.org	
34	Dr.	Lima Rahman	sc	Chief of Party, HIV/AIDS Program, Health, Nutrition & HIV/AIDS Sector	+8801713064044	lima.rahman@savethechildren.org	
35	Dr.	Shamim Jahan	SC	Director, Health, Nutrition & HIV/AIDS Sector	+8801730325147	shamim.jahan@savethechildren.org	
	and the same	1100 - 7		Others			
36							
37							
38							
39							
40							
41							
42							
43							
44							