



Country Coordinating Mechanism (BCCM)

Health Services Division
Ministry of Health and Family Welfare
BCCM Secretariat

Subject: Meeting notes with BRAC related to SR Evaluation (Damien Foundations)

| | |
|-------------------------------------|--|
| Date (DD.MM.YY) | 15 th November 2023 |
| Venue of the meeting | Mini Conference Room of HSD, MOHFW, Dhaka |
| Meeting started | 02:00 pm |
| Meeting adjourned | 03.30 pm |
| Meeting Chaired By | Md. Saidur Rahman Additional Secretary (WH) & Admin), HSD, MOHFW & Chair, BCCM-OC |
| Meeting facilitated by | Manaj Kumar Biswas BCCM Coordinator, BCCM Secretariat, HSD, MOHFW |
| Total number of participants | 15 |
| Meeting attendance | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Committee Members: 06• PR Representative(s): 04• Non CCM HSD, MOHFW: 02• LFA: 01• BCCM Secretariat: 04 |
| Attendance list | Yes |
| Others supporting document | Yes |

Agenda Items:

| Agenda Item | Title of Agenda Item |
|-----------------------|---|
| <i>Agenda Item: 1</i> | Performance Review issue of Damien Foundation and decreased their Working Area (from 13 district to 05 Districts) |
| <i>Agenda Item: 2</i> | Implementation arrangement for GC7 grant |
| <i>Agenda Item: 3</i> | AOB |

At the commencement of the meeting **Respected Md. Saidur Rahman, Additional Secretary (WH & Admin), HSD, MOHFW & Chair, BCCM OC welcomed** all the participants. He directed the Global Fund Bangladesh CCM Coordinator to facilitate the meeting in accordance with the predetermined agenda. The Global Fund Bangladesh CCM Coordinator facilitated this meeting with PR BRAC related to their SR Evaluations related to the SR Damien Foundation accordingly.

Agenda Item - 1: Performance Review issue of Damien Foundation and decreased their Working Area (from 13 district to 05 Districts)

Discussions by the constituencies:

BCCM Secretariat: BCCM Secretariat informed the meeting that Respected Prof. Dr. Ahmedul Kabir, ADG (Planning & Development) DGHS and The Vice-Chairperson of the Oversight Committee informed the last 49th OC BCCM Meeting about a letter from the Damien Foundation Head Quarter asserts about their exclusion from the GC7 TB Grants Implementation by their PR BRAC.

He mentioned that a signed letter addressing Hon'ble Minister, MOHFW and BCCM Chair from the Belgian Headquarters of Damien Foundation was received. The letter also copied the Oversight Chairperson, ADG Planning, LD (NTP), and BCCM Coordinator.

He mentioned that the letter stated that the Damien Foundation have been working to combat TB in Bangladesh even before the Global Fund funding. They started working with NTP after the GF started funding in Bangladesh as a SR of PR-2 (BRAC). As an SR, they have been working in 13 districts, serving 33 million people, and their performance -- as per their statement -- is excellent.

According to their statement, the Damien Foundation has been informed by different sources that PR2 (BRAC) is planning to discontinue the Damien Foundation as SR in the upcoming grant (no notification has been received yet by the Damien Foundation). In these circumstances, the 49th BCCM decided to form a committee Chaired by *Mr. Md. Saidur Rahman, Additional Secretary (WH & Admin)* HSD, MOHFW to resolve the PR and SR issues what Damien Foundation raised to BCCM Chair through their letter.

He informed the meeting that this committee also had a meeting with Damien Foundation on 6th November 2023. This committee discussed their issues in details related to their exclusion from 08 districts as implementing SR under PR BRAC. According to the 119th BCCM meeting decisions, this committee is also meeting today with PR BRAC for listening their stand on this decision of the decreasing working areas of DF as SR from 14 District to 05 Districts.

Finally, he requested Dr. Akramul Islam, Senior Director BRAC to present BRAC stand in the regard of Damien Foundation, their assessment process, their notification about their DF performance as SR etc.

PR BRAC: Dr. Md Akramul Islam, Senior Director BRAC presented and discussed the issues with a PPT presentation chronologically. He showed that comparative performance for all SRs including BRAC performance as implementers for the different performance indicators according to the TB Grant Performance Framework. He discussed that according to the all-SRs' National targets set up by NTP related to case notification, case identifications, treatment coverage etc. the comparative performance indicators report shows that most of the DF indicator achievements are significantly lower than other SRs. The snapshot are mentioned below:

Table 1: Case Notification Rates of SRs under PR BRAC

| Organization | 2021 (Target:171) | | 2022 (Target:172) | | 2023 (Target:173) | |
|-------------------|-------------------|--|-------------------|--|-------------------|--|
| | CNR (Achieved) | | CNR (Achieved) | | CNR (Achieved) | |
| Damien Foundation | 104 | | 116 | | 126 | |
| TLMI | 140 | | 135 | | 141 | |
| RDRS | 160 | | 138 | | 158 | |
| LAMB | 180 | | 177 | | 185 | |
| HEED | 207 | | 177 | | 167 | |
| UTPS | 235 | | 221 | | 218 | |
| DAM | 298 | | 294 | | 296 | |
| BAPSA | 329 | | 305 | | 311 | |
| BAMANEH | 532 | | 514 | | 438 | |
| Nari Maitree | 339 | | 323 | | 321 | |
| CWFD | 311 | | 297 | | 288 | |
| BGMEA | 379 | | 463 | | 478 | |
| BKMEA | 321 | | 359 | | 352 | |
| Tilottama | 363 | | 439 | | 412 | |
| RIC | 309 | | 312 | | 330 | |
| MAMATA | 137 | | 138 | | 170 | |
| Image | 183 | | 164 | | 151 | |
| Nishkriti | 255 | | 245 | | 246 | |
| KMSS | 532 | | 462 | | 563 | |
| PKS | 344 | | 340 | | 324 | |

Table:2: Performance of DF as geographical areas

| Year | 2021 (CNR Target: 171) | | 2022 (CNR Target: 172) | | 2023 (June) (CNR Target: 173) | |
|----------|------------------------|----------|------------------------|----------|-------------------------------|----------|
| | CNR | Coverage | CNR | Coverage | CNR | Coverage |
| Faridpur | 62 | 28% | 76 | 34% | 82 | 37% |

| | | | | | | |
|------------------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|
| Gopalganj | 72 | 33% | 77 | 35% | 86 | 39% |
| Rajbari | 54 | 24% | 54 | 24% | 62 | 28% |
| Madaripur | 70 | 32% | 78 | 35% | 83 | 38% |
| Shariatpur | 109 | 49% | 102 | 46% | 88 | 40% |
| FTLCP | 73 | 33% | 78 | 35% | 81 | 37% |
| Rajshahi | 80 | 36% | 89 | 40% | 100 | 45% |
| Naogaon | 90 | 41% | 107 | 48% | 110 | 50% |
| Nawabganj | 63 | 28% | 74 | 33% | 92 | 42% |
| RTLCP | 81 | 37% | 94 | 42% | 103 | 47% |
| Tangail | 137 | 62% | 147 | 67% | 160 | 73% |
| Jamalpur | 111 | 50% | 126 | 57% | 131 | 59% |
| TTLCP | 129 | 58% | 142 | 64% | 151 | 68% |
| NTLCP/Netrakona | 115 | 52% | 121 | 55% | 129 | 58% |
| Mymensingh | 114 | 51% | 127 | 57% | 141 | 64% |
| Kishoreganj | 151 | 68% | 171 | 77% | 198 | 89% |
| MTLCP | 132 | 60% | 141 | 64% | 169 | 77% |
| DF Bangladesh | 104 | 47% | 116 | 52% | 126 | 57% |

Table 3: Case Data TGF Review of SRs

| SR Name | Target of Number of notified cases | Achievement of notified cases | Achievement % |
|------------------------|------------------------------------|-------------------------------|---------------|
| PIME Sisters | 229 | 292 | 128% |
| Tilottama | 592 | 644 | 109% |
| RIC | 496 | 498 | 100% |
| DAM | 766 | 756 | 99% |
| PKS | 836 | 821 | 98% |
| LAMB | 1,725 | 1,693 | 98% |
| Nishkriti | 1,781 | 1,723 | 97% |
| BAMANEH | 713 | 688 | 96% |
| CWFD | 2,749 | 2,638 | 96% |
| Nari Maitree | 2,420 | 2,297 | 95% |
| UTPS | 922 | 869 | 94% |
| BAPSA | 1,071 | 992 | 93% |
| Image | 1,601 | 1,437 | 90% |
| KMSS | 3,920 | 3,406 | 87% |
| HEED Bangladesh | 19,331 | 16,277 | 84% |
| MAMATA | 1,597 | 1,228 | 77% |
| RDRS | 7,534 | 5,755 | 76% |
| TLMI | 5,464 | 4,088 | 75% |
| Damien Foundation (DF) | 56,716 | 36,099 | 64% |

As per the recommendation for the next phase implementation (GC7) from the Donor, BRAC as a PR opted for the SR consolidation to ensure maximum utilization of the grant resources and hence prepared a consolidation plan which is presented below in the Table.

Table 4: SRs consolidation Plan under PR BRAC according to the grant negotiation consensus and NTP Agreed Performance Framework for GC7 Grants

| SI | SRs | Coverage Area | Planned SRs(in GC7) |
|----|---------|--------------------|--|
| 1 | BAMANEH | DNCC Ward- 25 | BAPSA will implement in addition to their existing coverage area |
| 2 | DAM | DNCC Ward- 01 & 17 | CWFD will implement in addition to their existing coverage area |

| | | | |
|---|--------------------|--|--|
| 3 | UTPS | DNCC Ward- 10,11 & 16 | KMSS will implement in addition to their existing coverage area of DSCC and DNCC |
| 4 | KMSS (Khulna only) | KCC Ward- 07, 08, 09, 10, 11, 13, 14 & 15 | PKS-Khulna will implement in addition to their existing coverage area of KCC |
| 5 | BRAC | Sunamganj & Sylhet Urban | HEED |
| 6 | LAMB | 04 Upazila in Nilphamari and Dinajpur region | BRAC |
| 7 | TLMI | Thakurgaon & Panchagarh | BRAC |
| 8 | RDRS | Kurigram & Lalmonirhat | BRAC |

Finally, Dr. Akramul Islam also presented the BRAC implementations areas performance indicators according to the demand from the Prof. Dr. Ahmedul Kabir, ADG (Planing) DGHS. He mentioned that if the Government agreed on the lower targets for these indicators in the Performance Framework, then as PR BRAC does not have any problem. But as BRAC is accountable to the Government, NTP and donor GF to achieve the indicators in Agreed Performance Framework within the defined timeline for TB program in GC7 Grant cycle so it is not possible for BRAC as PR to continuing with this very low performing SR in the GC7 in the mentioned areas

He informed the meeting that BRAC noticed this underperformance of the DF and time to time notified DF to enhance their performance and to strengthen their performance. But no improvement according to requirement. However, BRAC decided to take the responsibilities to enhance performance where (8 Districts) their (DF) performance is much lower than the expected or targeted and continue by the DF where their performance is slightly better (5 districts in Mymensingh region). He requested the meeting to discuss this and resolve this DF raised issue.

Dr. Shayla Islam, Associate Director, BRAC Communicable Disease Programme informed that TB case referral issue varies for different partners based on their individual strategy to implement and few indicators like HIV testing among TB patients and TB preventive Treatment (TPT) is lower in different quarters of the GC6 due to shortage of kit and drug supplies from NTP. She also mentioned that it is actually the dual track financing and the overall programme strategy will be the similar in the GC7 (as proposed) whoever the implementer is. Detailed implementation plan (by SRs/implementers) changes in different stages after submission to grant finalization considering the existing results and value for money issues. BRAC as PR still is in the process of finalization of SR consolidation with the Donor (TGF) and hope to inform the final implementation plan with NTP and BCCM shortly.

PR NTP; Dr. Mahfuzer Rahman, LD NTP & TBL presented a monitoring report on few indicators what NTP does. He also mentioned that though NTP M & E report showing the few indicators but these all are not according to the Performance Framework indicators. The NTP indicator report mentioned below:

| Major implementing Partner wise Performance on some core indicators in rural areas during 2022 | | | | | |
|--|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| Indicators | BRAC | DF | RDRS | TLMIB | HEED |
| | CNR (All Forms) | CNR (All Forms) | CNR (All Forms) | CNR (All Forms) | CNR (All Forms) |
| Case Notofocation Rate | 147.25 | 101.21 | 159.53 | 139.97 | 177.44 |
| Percentage of HIV Test Among TB Patients | 23.37% | 30.09% | 16.05% | 5.03% | 28.63% |
| Case Refferal from Private Sector | 18.99% | 34.21% | 16.91% | 17.44% | 18.05% |
| Case Refferal from Public Sector | 23.50% | 26.98% | 8.63% | 7.35% | 24.32% |
| Case Refferal from Community Sector | 57.51% | 38.81% | 74.47% | 75.21% | 57.63% |

Academia: Dr. Asif Mujtaba, TB Expert Member opined that being unfamiliar with the TGF review procedure, he inquired when and who did it and wanted to see the TGF review documentation. He stated that in the Joint Monitoring Mission (JMM) program review not mentioned poor performance of Damien Foundation. Due to limited diagnostic test, logistics, poor sample transportation, and gene expert cartridge

shortages, Rangpur and certain Dhaka division districts reported less TB case notification rates in November 2022, according to APA. If the immediate solutions taken by PRs than TB case detection will rise. He also wants to understand about SRs' program implementation changes in grant negotiation program.

Prof. M A Faiz, Former Vice Chair BCCM and Expert member of the BCCM Oversight Committee discussed that according to 82nd BCCM meeting, Mr. Richard Cunliffe emphasized that CCM selects PRs, and PRs choose their own SRs, and they are legally accountable for all SR activities and financial expenditures as they signed the framework agreement. On SR management manual mentioned that PR will evaluate the performance of SRs at central level, NTP and WHO jointly present in the evaluation meeting of SR. They will discuss about technical management supply system, referral, coordination at local levels and decision will be taken accordingly. Regarding above mentioned discussion he wants to see the documents of SRs performance review.

The Government: Prof. Ahmedul Kabir, ADG Planning DGHS emphasized that inadequate BRAC's case detection rate and referral system were in comparison to other SRs. Since the Damien Foundation receives a higher percentage of case referrals from the public, private, and community sectors than BRAC, all CNR metrics are superior to BRAC. He also mentioned that true case identification and false case submission reflect on test number and it should be reviewed properly. Then he wants to see the KAP notification parameter in order to view the SR performance and result was satisfactory. The ADG Planning, Prof. Dr. Ahmedul Kabir suggested having separate and together meetings with PR BRAC and SR Damien before holding any decision. He is interested in knowing how SR is terminated and who bears the responsibility for SR's liability?

PR BRAC: Md. Akramul Islam, Senior Director, BRAC Health Program responded that the following the Global Fund's Grant Approvals Committee (GAC) approval, Principal Recipients (PRs) must decide on and finalize the Implementation arrangement mapping of Sub-Recipient (SR) by December 2023, making necessary alterations as needed. Mr. Urban from the Global Fund highlighted in the grant-making process that treatment coverage is a key indicator in the performance framework of PRs, with a goal of achieving 90% coverage by 2026. Consequently, the primary focus for PRs should be on ensuring absolute case identification, accurate case notification, and comprehensive treatment coverage nationwide. So, to achieve the goal, the continuation of SRs will be determined based on the compliance with the Global Fund's regulations (discussed above) not only the case notification indicator. BRAC and NTP agreed to cooperate in Rangpur and Dhaka division despite of Damien Foundation to improve case identification, treatment coverage and other services after seeing the SRs report of Grant making negotiation. He further ensures that BRAC did not recommend to cut off Damien Foundation as SR, but rather advising Damien Foundation to focus on the accountable region.

BCCM Secretariat: Mr. Manaj Kumar Biswas finally informed that the Oversight Chair should get PRs NTP and BRAC's future agreement's Performance Framework for GC7 Grant. It should be discussed and reported at the next meeting of this Committee BCCM meeting. In The 116th BCCM meeting minutes, Damien Foundation will remain SR, but its work area is constrained due to lower case notification and treatment coverage. PR 1 NTP's expert department oversee field-level program implementation.

The BCCM Coordinator also informed the meeting that the 49th BCCM Oversight Committee headed by Mr. Md. Saidur Rahman, Additional Secretary (WH), HSD, MOHFW and Chair, BCCM Oversight Committee to analyze the technicality and justification of the discontinuation decision for the Damien Foundation as SR in next Grant Cycle by the PR BRAC. Accordingly, this committee met both Damien Foundation and BRAC separately to find out the solution stated in the letter from Damien Foundation Head Quarter, Belgium. Now this committee will discuss and analyses this issue within the committee members and recommend the solutions.

The Chairperson: Mr. Md. Saidur Rahman, Additional Secretary (Admin & WH) stated that this committee met both PR BRAC and SR DF and got information about their issues about the Working Area distribution in GC7 Grant cycle. Next this Committee will meet within the committee members soon and make the recommendations for the solution of this raised issue by DF.

Decision: *The meeting decided to that the Expert Committee headed by Additional Secretary (Admin & WH) would meet within the committee members and would analyze the information what gather from both PR BRAC and SR Damien Foundation separately and make the recommendations to find out the solution stated in the letter from Damien Foundation Head Quarter, Belgium*

Having no other issues to discuss, the Chairperson thanked all participants for their attendance and active participation and wrapped up the meeting.



Md. Saidur Rahman
Additional Secretary (WH & Admin)
HSD, MOHFW
&
BCCM OC Chair

*BCCM Received from HSD
Signed copy on 20th December 2023
20/12/2023*